



**FINAL REPORT ON THE STUDY OF
THE PERFORMANCE OF THE ADDIS ABABA CITY
ADMINISTRATION SOCIAL SERVICE PROVIDING
BUREAU WOMEN AFFAIRS OFFICES (GENDER DESKS)**

Submitted to

Addis Ababa Women's Association (AAWA)

Produced by:

ATEM CONSULTANCY SERVICE

Tel: 0911 25 31 61, 0911418062, 0911934672

e-mail: atemconsult12@gmail.com

P.O.Box 59637-Addis Ababa

November, 2022

Contents

LIST OF TABLES.....	3
LIST OF FIGURES	ERROR! BOOKMARK NOT DEFINED.
ACKNOWLEDGMENT	4
ACRONYMS	5
INTRODUCTION:	6
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	6
ORGANIZATIONAL ARRANGEMENT	7
ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS.....	8
METHODOLOGY	8
SOURCES OF DATA.....	8
DOCUMENT REVIEW	9
SAMPLING	9
DATA COLLECTION INSTRUMENTS.....	10
INTERVIEW GUIDE.....	10
DATA COLLECTION.....	10
METHODS OF DATA ANALYSIS	11
RESULTS - DISCUSSIONS	11
GENDER MAINSTREAMING	19
MAJOR FINDINGS OF THE STUDY	22
RECOMMENDATIONS GIVEN	24
CONCLUSION	26

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1 Planned Key informant respondents	9
Table 2 Frequency of mention on knowledge and qualification.....	13
Table 3 frequency of mention on major responsibility	15
Table 4 frequency of mention on protection and empowerment	17
Table 5 Frequency of mention on women decision, mainstreaming..	19
Table 6 Frequency of mention gender mainstreaming	21

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The consultant Team would like to thank AAWA for partnering with ATEM consulting firm to undertake this study. We would like to thank AAWA management and technical staff and partners for their outstanding technical support to conduct this study. The cooperation of various groups and partners was so encouraging that it has contributed to smooth running of this assignment and success of the study. We thank the study subjects of this assessment who showed maximum cooperation during data collection. Most of all, we appreciate the cooperation of top management, experts, individuals who participated in the key informant in-depth interview (KII) in providing valuable information during data collection.

The Consultant Team

ACRONYMS

AA	Addis Ababa
ACS	ATEM Consultancy service
AIDS.....	Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome
BCC	Behavioral Change Communication
CBC	Community Based Child Well-being
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CVs	Curriculum Vitae
GBV	Gender Based Violence
HEW	Health Extension Workers
HIV	Human Immune Virus
HTP	Harmful Traditional Practice
HR	Human Resource
IEC.	Information, Education and Communication
IGA	Income Generating Activity
IMR	Infant Mortality Rate
KII	Key Informant In-depth Interview
MMR	Maternal Mortality Rate
IYC.....	Infant and Young Children
SWOT	Strength, Weakness, Opportunity and Threa
ToT	Training of Trainers
TOR	Terms of Reference
UN	United Nations
VAW	Violence against Women
WA	Women's Affair

INTRODUCTION:

Addis Ababa Women's Association, a Women's Right organization functional in Addis Ababa, is now implementing a "**Women's Voice and Leadership (WVL) project in Addis Ababa**" with the financial and technical support of Plan International Ethiopia and Global Affairs Canada. The **Overall objective** of the project being to advancing Gender equality and women empowerment, the project aims mainly on improving institutional management and sustainability and enhancing the performance of programming and advocacy

Cognizant of the availability of women affairs offices (Gender desks) at the Addis Ababa city administration sectoral Bureaus, the desks are structures within the public sector Bureaus meant to mainstream gender at the work place that promote the rights of women at the work place. Particularly, for AAWA the Desks should provide a vital helping hand towards ensuring the equal participation and protection of women's right at work place VAW and GBV. However, the performance so far remains uneven, and largely weak. Hence, aiming at strengthen the gender desks, AAWA has planned to conduct Performance review study of the AA city administration sectoral gender desks with emphasis on the social service providing Bureaus. This report is produced based on the study conducted in this regard

The General objectives of the performance review is to Conduct assessment/study of the performance of the AA city *Social Service providing Bureaus Women Affairs Desks* identifying the strength, weaknesses, challenges and gaps in the implementation of gender programs in line with National and International policies and action plans to protect of women's right in Social, Economic and Political spheres. As part of advocacy intervention, the findings/report of the study will provide an entry point for evidence-based advocacy and influencing works to improve the role of women affairs desks in addressing gender equality and enhance women empowerment interventions

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Gender mainstreaming is simply looking at the human implications of any activity, highlighting the differences between women and men and thus the potential differential impacts and designing the activity to ensure that both men and women will benefit equally. These include

- Work-life balance and organizational culture.
- Gender balance in leadership and decision making.
- Gender equality in recruitment and career progression.
- Integration of the sex/gender dimension into research and teaching content.
- Measures against gender-based violence including sexual harassment.

The ultimate goal of mainstreaming is **to achieve gender equality.**" Mainstreaming includes gender-specific activities and affirmative action, whenever women or men are in a particularly disadvantageous position. Gender mainstreaming is not only for attaining gender equality, but is also a pre-condition for social justice and sustainable socio-economic development of society as a whole.

At national level, the government is responsible for the implementation of Gender mainstreaming. However, it is not only the responsibility of specific individuals working in certain areas or units. While specific structures should be established and persons responsible appointed, the responsibility for implementing gender mainstreaming should be with the entire staff of public institutions, under the leadership of the management.

A political commitment for gender equality and a compatible legal framework are the basic conditions for the development of a successful gender mainstreaming strategy

In recent years, the concept of gender mainstreaming has been widely accepted by national governments, international institutions, and development agencies in most parts of the world as an international approach not only for attaining gender equality, but also as a pre-condition for sustainable socio-economic development of society as a whole.

As part of global movements, the federal democratic government of Ethiopia has declared its unequivocal commitment to the development of women and to addressing the issues of gender inequalities that deter long lasting changes with the announcement of the national policy on women in 1993, and, consequently, support structures for policy implementation have been put in place. The promulgation of the new constitution guarantees all citizens' equality before the law, equality of access to economic opportunities, prohibits any discrimination on the ground of gender, overall review of family law and penal codes, identifies and changes any discrimination provision against women.

Ethiopia has ratified relevant continental and international instruments pertaining to gender. At the continental level, Ethiopia has signed the Protocol to the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa. Globally, the Ethiopian Government is signatory to most international instruments, conventions and declarations on gender equality, including: The Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), Millennium Development Goals Declaration (MDGS), and is party to commitments such as the International Conference on Population and Development (ICPD) and the Beijing platform of Action, which clearly demonstrate the existence of the political will and of an enabling environment for pursuing the objectives of gender equality in the country (MOWA, 2010)

In line with this, aiming at gender mainstreaming at the work place, the Addis Ababa city administration has enshrined and established Gender Desks in its all sector Bureaus. Staffs are assigned and budget allocated to the desks. However, the study has found that the performance of the gender desks is weak from the perspective of the objective of Gender mainstreaming at the work place. The main reason for the weak performance is that Gender Mainstreaming is a new strategy which calls for significant change to the status quo. Such far reaching change require time, capacity building training, significant resource allocation and political commitments for their implementation (appropriate institutional mechanism)

Organizational arrangement

The consultant team is composed of experts from multidisciplinary backgrounds actively participate in the planning of the fieldwork, and preparation of guidelines questions and checklists, facilitate initiation and follow up contact with focal institutions in the study area, actively participated in the administration

of interview with key informants, and execution of other selected methodologies under the guidance of the lead consultant and prepare the assignment report.

In general, the consultant team in close consultation with the client and the client-coordinated the study activity from the design stage till report writing. The consultant team worked closely with **the client** and its partners in the course of identifying the target group to be sampled from each site.

Data collection was held at the field level deploying qualified staffs with past experience in data collection. Moreover staffs deployed for data collection were offered training on the data collection technique and purpose of the study. The data collection was supervised by senior staffs of the consulting firm.

Interviewers above diploma holders recruited and get adequate training. Supervisors with better education background assigned to follow up the interviewers closely to clearly maintain the quality of data and information collected.

Ethical Considerations

Assessment permission letter obtained from the client. All concerned bodies communicated through formal letter from client and permission obtained from all governmental institutions and concerned individuals. The objectives of the study explained to all participants of the assessment in order to get informal verbal and/or written consent. Moreover; the participants of the research informed that their name will not appear in any part of the assessment document and the information will only be used for the research purpose. Those participants who are not willing to participate in the study were not forced to participate. Moreover, all the consulting team engaged in the study have signed the code of conduct after reading the safeguarding policy manual of the Addis Ababa Women's Association.

METHODOLOGY

The qualitative approach was employed to explore the Gender desks strength, weaknesses, challenges and gaps in the implementation of gender programs in line with National and International policies and action plans to protect of women's right in in Social, Economic and Political spheres, The methodologies applied to conduct the study included Key Informant interview (KII). The performance review focused on, but not limited to

- Women and girl's empowerment/gender program aimed at equal participation in a social, economic and political spheres and share benefit equally.
- Women participation and access to social and economic services and resources that are being rendered by the sector Bureaus.
- Ensuring equal opportunities (employment, promotion, and staff development) of women employees and ensure protection of work place GBVNAW.
- Response to prevention and mitigation of GBVNAW and support being given to GBV survivors.
- Gender mainstreaming and gender responsive budgeting,

SOURCES OF DATA

In this study, both primary and secondary data were used as source of information. Primary data were collected by interviewing the heads and deputy heads of the bureaus, process owners and desk team leaders of the selected Bureaus. As part of primary source, Key informant interview Was held among Gender focal persons of the bureau Gender desks.

To support the primary data, secondary data was collected through an extensive review of annual and quarter reports of the bureaus and the gender desks, selected Bureaus Gender mainstreaming manuals, and Gender training manuals are used as secondary sources. Moreover, documents like national policies are also used as secondary data.

DOCUMENT REVIEW

The document review included an assessment of available information from the existing document in the client organization in relation to the subject area. The document review also included other works conducted globally, in African countries and in Ethiopia to record their experiences, lessons and best practices on issues related to the subject area. A checklist of documents prepared and reviewed exclusively by the consultant team.

SAMPLING

1. Target bureaus

The performance review study has taken the social service providing Bureau gender desks as sample for the study. These included

- i. Education Bureau
- ii. Health Bureau
- iii. Transport Bureau
- iv. Women, children and Social affairs Bureau (Gender directorate)
- v. Public Service and HR Bureau
- vi. Housing development and management
- vii. Justice Bureau (Attorney)
- viii. Police Commission
- ix. Water and sewerage authority
- x. Micro and Small Enterprises development

2. Target interviewees

The head of the gender desk and two other experts including the bureau head planned to be interviewed using KII checklist. The following Table presents Planned KII in the ten bureaus.

Table 1 Planned Key informants respondents

Bureau	Gender desk	Head	Total

1. Education Bureau	3	1	4
2. Health Bureau	3	1	4
3. Transport Bureau	3	1	4
4. Women, children and Social affairs Bureau (Gender Directorate)	3	1	4
5. Public Service and HR Bureau	3	1	4
6. Housing Development and Management	3	1	4
7. Justice Bureau (Attorney)	3	1	4
8. Police Commission	3	1	4
9. Water and sewerage authority	3	1	4
10. Micro and Small scale Enterprises Development	3	1	4
Total	30	10	40

DATA COLLECTION INSTRUMENTS

The researcher developed and utilized two main instruments of data collection tools to increase the depth of information obtained from the respondents. These included Semi structured interview for the head and for experts in the gender desk .

- Planned to interview the 1 bureaus heads and 3 staffs of the gender desk from each Bureau. However, since the gender desks were closed, staffs from gender desks are not found, instead 2 staffs of the Bureau were interviewed making the total 10 Heads and 20 staff of Bureaus. The interview was conducted in their respective offices from half to 45 minutes time each. Open ended questions were used to understand the why and the how part of the assessment that can enable us to achieve the study goal
- The study tool was subjected to pre-testing to ensure they are user-friendly, specific and suited for the allotted time.

INTERVIEW GUIDE

After finalizing the data collection instrument interview guide prepared for the study. The guide was prepared on how to complete the questionnaire, on the selection of the samples and on the process of recording after interview.

DATA COLLECTION

Data collection was held at the field level deploying qualified staffs with past experience in data collection. Moreover staffs deployed for data collection were offered training on the data collection technique and purpose of the study. The data collection was supervised by senior staffs of the consulting firm.

Interviewers above diploma holders recruited and get adequate training. Supervisors with better education background assigned to follow up the interviewers closely to clearly maintain the quality of data and information collected.

METHODS OF DATA ANALYSIS

The data that was gathering through semi – structured interview were analyzed in thematic analysis method. In organizing the primary data, the researcher thoroughly reads the written information from notes and documents that were helpful for the study.

After the preparation of full written transcripts of the recorded data, the researcher reviewed the transcripts to sort data and identify patterns based on the questions in the interview guide, grouping them into themes based on the general and specific study objectives. Finally, the data were analyzed by using thematic analysis method by carefully transforming the qualitative data into textual form.

RESULTS - DISCUSSIONS

i. Availability of Gender Desks

The assessment in relation to gender desk or among the ten bureaus found in Addis Ababa revealed that four major status and highlighted below

a) Bureau without gender desk or focal person

Among the ten Bureaus we found one bureau without gender desk and without gender focal person. This bureau is Addis Ababa Transport Bureau. As this is public service providing We encourage this bureau to assign with focal person and extend to gender desk.

b) Bureau with focal person

These Bureaus include:

- Justice Bureau(Attorney)
- Water & Sewerage

c) Bureau with gender desk at directorate level

These Bureaus include:

- Education
- Health

d) Bureau / the umbrella for policy and strategy direction at city level

Women, Children & Social Affairs Bureau: structurally or by any other means, not linked with the sector bureaus

Fourteen respondents of the KII informed that, currently there is no gender desk in their office. Simply there are focal persons, which are not capable to conduct different activities due to lack of budget and lack of attention by organization staffs. Even though the focal persons plan to do

different interventions, the office did not give priority gender issues. Most of the focal persons used limited money from other budgets like HIV/AIDS.

ii. Views of Heads of the Bureaus

The interview to the heads of the Bureau was based on the following pre – organized questions

1. Is gender Desk roles and responsibilities well known, do the desks have description of duties and responsibilities
2. Are qualified staffs in Gender assigned to the desk
3. Is there an effort to women empowerment
4. Is there policy/guideline to promote women to decision making positions
5. Is there gender mainstreaming and manual, Is gender responsive budgeting practiced
6. Is the gender desk linked to other sectors like HR, Finance...
7. Is gender considered during planning and budgeting
8. Is there a guideline for protection of women from discrimination

In line to the above questions, most of the heads believe that gender mainstreaming has to be there to empower women in all different activities, to increase the participation of women in decision making and to enhance women protection from GBV at organizational level . However the majority of the bureaus do not have gender desk except education and health to follow up the issues. For example, The Head of the education office revealed any activity to education including curriculum development is seen from gender lens. Besides at school level there are many activities implemented to empower girls through employing clubs in the schools.

According to the head of justice Bureau, the organizations support the empowerment of women during employment, training and leadership. For example in AA Justice Bureau the head and other 4 senior positions are held by women. The head said that for the time being they have only one focal person. In the future they have a plan to strengthen to desk or directorate level. Concerning budget allocation, they have not had the system set for allocation but the tendency is allocating per the benefit of women. The justice bureau always support empowerment of women socially, economically and politically and support to work with AA women association and appreciated the study and support the output to share for all sectors.

The opinion of the head of education sector responds as the directorate does not have qualified staffs. There are about six staffs including the head of the directorate but they are not in a position to work per the level of requirement. They have to be equal or excel to other directorate to really bring attention of others for gender mainstreaming.

According the discussion held among the heads

- Some of the heads like that of the Education, Health, Justice Bureau have a good commitment for gender mainstreaming. The Justice Bureau Head who has only one focal person at desk level is making her effort to upgrade to directorate level. She also mentioned that 4 of the justice departments are led by women with proud.
- The gender desks do not have a well-articulated duties and responsibilities and job description for focal persons

- Gender is not institutionalized in that there is no guideline to protect women from any abuse and discrimination
- Gender desks are not member of employment and promotion committee and there is no guideline on employment and promotion for women
- Gender mainstreaming and gender responsive budgeting are not known much and not practiced at all

iii. *Staffs of the Bureaus: Knowledge on National and International policies and organizational objectives*

A total of 40 KII respondents were planned to be interviewed. From planned KIIs, a total of 30 KII respondents were interviewed from 10 Bureaus in AA City Administration. Among the total of 30 respondents, 10 of them are heads and the remaining 20 are from the gender desk and focalpersons

The following table shows the frequency of responses of the 20 KII respondents on the different questions shown in the KII checklist.

Table 2 frequency of responses on knowledge on organization objectives, national and inter. policy and qualification of the staff. The majority, about 8 KIIs respondents know partially the organization’s objectives. On the other hand 6 respondents confirmed as they know the objectives of their organizations while the remaining six do not know. The major job description of the gender desk is:

- Ensure Gender equality
- Ensure women participation
- Ensure child protection
- Stand & support anti GBV movement
- Awareness raising and advocacy

The KII respondents have mentioned as there are different issues in relation to child right, women’s empowerment, and protection from GBV and related issues.

Table 2 Frequency of mention on knowledge and qualification

Questions	Response	Frequency of mention
1. Does the gender desk or the focal person know the organization objective	1.yes	6
	2. Partially	8
	3. No	6

2. The job description of the gender desk? does it have relation with organization objective	1. Ensure gender equality	5
	2. Ensure women participation	4
	3. Ensure child protection	7
	4. Follow GBV	6
	5. Awareness raising and advocacy	6
	6/ Others	5
3 National policy	1. Ensure women equality	4
	2. State child rights	7
	3. Protection of women from GBV	6
	4. Protections from HTP	6
4. International Policy	1. Equal education rights	5
	2. Child protection	4
	3. Protect from GBV	7
	4. Women in leadership and decision	6
5. Does the gender desk have qualified staff	1. Yes	6
	2. Partially	5
	3. No	12

n>20 due to multiple response

iv. Responsibility of the Gender desks

As shown under Table 3 and according to the KII respondents the major responsibility of the gender desk or the focal persons include:

- Ensure that women participation socially are maintained equally
- Promote job creation for women to ensure equal participation economically
- Promote women leadership at different level to ensure equal participation of women politically
- Women protection from GBV
- Ensure gender equality in different directions
- Promote decision making and participation of women

The Education bureau respondent revealed some of their activities are awareness creation, research, panel discussion, related to women's empowerment. The Education bureau itself has a mandate of empowering girls and with integration to different sections engages in all rounded development efforts. At school level many efforts are being implemented and the directorate supports them.

One of the respondent from the gender directorate clearly revealed they are doing their best to acquire experience sharing from other sectors, and the other from the staff disclosed as they do not have qualified staff though there are activities to be done. However, per the evaluation of nine months 2014 gender performance report, the sector has taken as a good performer relatively compared to others. Whereas, the Health bureau's Gender's at structure level there are eight staffs but at present functional four. There is no adequate budget though many activities have to be implemented related to women's

health. Police commission respondents have also revealed as they do not have adequate staffs, at sub cities level there are teams that are engaged in gender issues.

The Water & Sewerage Authority also do not have adequate human power. At head office level it is just one person the head of gender desk. At nine branches of the water sewerage organization, focal person is assigned and through providing TOT, an effort is being made to aware gender issues and addresses the problem.

The respondents from Public Service and HRBureau witnessed that they are doing their efforts to empower women economically, socially and politically. They have appreciated the study by the AA Women Association and will cooperate in its implementation at all levels in their bureau.

The KII respondents from Housing development and management respondents' witnessed that their responsibility is to ensure women empowerment socially, economically and politically. They have a plan to ensure that 30% of women benefits from housing development plan.

The focal person from Justice Bureau(Attorney) witnessed their responsibility is to ensure the wellbeing of women economically, socially and politically within the organization and to give justice service outside the organization. She mentioned that the focal person is establish and worked only for one month. Hence, they have not much experience to share in this empowerment areas.

Table 3 frequency of mention on major responsibility of the Gender desks

Questions	Response	Frequency of response
6. What are the major responsibilities of the gender desk or the focal person, socially, politically and economically?	1. Ensure that women participation socially are maintained equally	4
	2. Promote job creation for women to ensure equal participation economically	5
	3. Promote women leadership at different level to ensure equal participation of women politically	6
	4. Women protection from GBV	3
	5. Promote decision making and participation of women	4
	6. Ensure gender equality in different directions	5
	7. Others	6
7. At What stage is equality of gender ensured in your organization socially, politically and economically?	1. Socially there is an effort to promote social participation of women	6
	2. Politically at least one third of women are in leadership position in the education bureau	5
	3. Economically the desk is encouraging the government and private sectors to employ women who have the potential for the job	4
	4. Participated to make sure women are equally treated	3
	5. Planned to make 30% of women participate in housing development	2
	6. Some bureaus establish focal persons very recently	4

	hence no significant efforts are observed	
	7. Others	5

N>20 due to multiple response

v. Major Activities of the desks

a/response to prevention and mitigation of GBV/ VAW and support being given to GBVsurvivors

In education bureau, there is guideline employed at school level for GBV. It is Anti GBV manual. It is all about efforts to mitigate & stop GBV and HTP. It has a system of managing it. It is a code of conduct on prevention of school related GBV. The guideline has a definition and all about GBV limit of application at school level both inside and outside the compound, types of school related Gender based violence, types of punishments, school related GBV complaint investigation and decisions recommending committee, and other regulations.

Besides, the document the Anti GBV namely ‘A.A. administration Coalitions to prevent and mitigate GBV & HTPs’ is published by A.A Women’s & children’s office in November 2010. The manual ‘Coalition to prevent & mitigate GBV&HTP’s at the city level is a comprehensive that incorporated different government, NGO’s and civic society organizations. It describes the purpose of the Coalition, members of the Coalition, the role of each sector, the expected result, mentioned system of monitoring, support & evaluation and system of reporting.

Hence, the guide line of Women’s Affair, FDRE MOH guideline on Workplace Harassment , prevention & Control and The code of conduct on prevention of School related GBV in School of MOE in 2014 are basic for the determination of government ’ efforts. The question that may be raised is to what extent it becomes functional. Per the guideline committee is formed and there is a system to make it functional and accountable the perpetrators of VAW. There is an incident at school level where the vice Director appeals as she has encountered GBV and per data collected & investigated measure has been taken.

The health section works on VAW mitigation efforts to the woreda level. According MOH there is a VAW guideline but it is not fully implemented, it is on the process of introducing the manual. There is also One Stop Center (OSC) where concerned sectors such as Police, Attorney, health professional, etc. works with integration on creating awareness and mitigation efforts of GBV, there is a system to manage GBV for victims.

FDRE Ministry of Health (MOH) guideline on workplace harassment prevention & Response issued in 2022. The guideline is a publication and it has incorporated the legal frameworks on workplace harassment, prevention measures and complaint handling procedures.

b/ Efforts related to Women’s Empowerment / access to resources such as training, employment, promotion

One of the respondents of Education bureau revealed clearly as the gender Directorate does not have any role against women’s empowerment at institution level engaging in different committees. However, the

directorates engage in provision of training for staff, women leaders and the like by using different systems. The head of the Education sector revealed as there is no such a problem during employment, promotion and training related to gender. Besides, leaders from Federal level to woreda level are visiting schools at elementary and secondary level and particularly promote girl students.

The health sector gender directorate described as Affirmative action is being implemented and 3% for women and 4% for the disabled is being practiced and the directorate monitors and supports the system of implementation. The Directorate being a member of the management committee follows and made efforts. The directorate also facilitates education and trainings for women. In the same way, there are conditions that police commission supports and promotes women in affirmative action.

Regarding women's empowerment, the gender desk head of Water & Sewerage clearly revealed as she has a gap of getting guidelines or regulations particularly related to affirmative measures related to employment, promotion and training related to addressing gender issues, She has also tried to get from women's affair and concerned bodies but could not. Besides, the head clearly revealed as nowadays Gender Desk in different sectors are out of the structure. Besides, she revealed that gender desk head is not a member of employment, training and promotion committee, there are women members in some committees however the level of awareness and commitment to raise and address gender in the context of the sector is not clear and adequate.

The other Bureaus like public service, Micro & small enterprise witnessed as the chance that relates to women promotion training and related issues are given in priority to women.

Table 4 frequency of responses on protection and empowerment of women,

Variables	Response	Frequ ency
Women protection from GBV	1. To protect girls from violence , there is a rule drafted in 2007 Ethiopian calendar	4
	2. When Violence on any women occur AAWC Bureau react with the gender section of the education bureau	3
	3. When Violence occur on any women at work place she gets first health service followed by legal service	4
	4. In the education sector School clubs played significant role	3
	5. Guideline Prepared by the education and health bureau	2
	6. One stop center play significant role	5
	7. Legal sectors of the organization follow GBV	2
	8. No protection in their bureau	6
	9. There is an article against GBV or VAW	4
	10. OTHERS	5
Women's empowerment	1. The education bureau witnessed that training has been given to empower women in the education sector	4
	2. There is affirmative action in the health sector	4
	3. The public service give opportunity when the chance for women come.	5
	4. it is performed based on the 3%	2
	5. Others	7

c/ Efforts made to bring women's to Decision making power

As Education sector Gender Directorate revealed that there are occasion's leaders at lower level have been given leadership training to empower them to higher level. The head of the sector revealed as there are efforts made to empower women to bring to leader ship position. Gender directorate is not the member of the management team. However, they are member of the counseling team. Gender Directorate in the health bureau revealed that trainings were given to female staff on different topics including on leadership skill. Out of the management 14 directorate five of them are female. Out of the management team that is 20, seven of them are female. The directorate is also a member of the management team. 70% of women staffs of the health sector are female. However, only 30% of them come to the position. Out of 11 sub cities who are head of health office, four of them are female.

The respondents from the police commission clearly revealed that no effort made to bring women's to decision making power. For ex. Out of 18 higher level officials that are accountable to Main & vice Commissioner only one is vice commissioner level. Besides, as coming to the leadership position at police commission level is challenging for women, most of the women even who has access to the position are not much interested. The position for competition is open to both sexes though in some cases women are not interested. The water sewerage bureau gender desk revealed as nothing special is done so far. There is a gap in brining women to decision making power. Women's in decision making power in the sector at all level does not exceed 20%. The gender desk of both the police commission and water sewerage are not a member of the management committee.

The other sectors like public service, Small enterprise witnessed as there is an effort to promote women decision power and use different means to put them in leadership position.

d/ Relationship of the gender desks with other sectors

Out of the four respondents of Education Bureau, two of them revealed as the Directorate of women's Affair activities and mission is derived from the education section. The other two responded as they work on awareness raising on different topics, gender mainstreaming, and are engaged in annual anniversary such as March 8, White ribbon day etc. Hence, there is lack of clarity and they could not provide written document with respect to Gender as section. The Head of the education office revealed any activity to education including curriculum development is seen from gender lens. Besides at school level there are many activities implemented to empower girls through employing clubs in the schools.

Health Bureau Gender mainstreaming Directorate has also revealed as their plan is derived from the National Strategic plan of the MOH and about 14 key activities are being implemented. Regarding police Commission, there are two kinds of women's structure engaged on gender issues. Women's Affairs related to capacity building on the one hand and women's, children's criminal investigation and treatment on the other hand. The former is more engaged on capacity building. The respondent revealed as the work/activity is included in the mission and through preparing module for training, provide training to new members of the commission, and celebrate annual holidays related to women such as March 8, White ribbon day etc. She also added as they provide training on gender issues at sub city and woreda level. Capacity building training in this year mainly focused on coaching and supporting female police members that obtained low result, promoted female police to continue their education, get computer training, etc. Besides, with the consultation of federal and regional concerned bodies, the unit also facilitates for 31

female leaders who have to promote from inspector to main inspector to get special support / an opportunity of training at Sandafa. The head of this section clearly revealed as they do not have any know how on women’s policies, strategies, laws related to addressing gender issues.

The commander in charge of women’s children’s investigation and treatment on the other hand strongly commented the two structures of gender in one commission has to be given due attention and be corrected. She also mentioned that the division capacity on prevention of crime and women’s empowerment is lower when compared to other regions. The Addis Ababa Water & Sewerage Authority Gender Desk head clearly revealed that their organization incorporated the cross cutting issues such as HIV/AIDS, Gender and Disability in the 5 and 10 years plan. The effort of the organization to access water for the community at large and be a solution to the problem of water benefits primarily women. However, there sector is a one person gender desk.

The Gender structure of the Education and Health bureau are at the Directorate level and more or less in a better position than the others.

Table 5. Frequency of responses on women decision making, mainstreaming and management meeting

Questions	Response	Frequency
Women in Decision making power/ leadership position	1. No women in the section but there may be at sub city and school levels	7
	2. There is an effort to bring women through carrier	8
	3. Others	6
Gender mainstreaming	1. Yes it is included in the plan but there is no adequate budget for implementation	6
	2. There is an effort to mainstream with other sectors	7
	3. Others	8
Participation in MC	1. Yes	5
	2. No	6
	3. Sometimes	9

GENDER MAINSTREAMING

The head of the Education sector gender directorate responds as they do not have a direct budget but if they planned and requested they do have a chance of getting budget. They are more engaged on celebration of March 8. White Ribbon Day, Children’s day, etc. Besides, using the pool fund, training or awareness creation and budget is allocated for monitoring and support.

However according the head of the sector, he responded there is gender mainstreaming strategy and it part of the education bureau’s plan. For example, in teacher’s development plan there are detail activities related to empowering, transfer, and promotion of teachers including female teachers. The problem is related to work in integration with the Gender Directorate or concerned section. If the Gender directorate plans, and articulates their needs, fund is not as such a problem for it can be pulled

from finance section. The Gender directorate is more dependent on Donor's driven fund for celebrating World Women's Day, White ribbon day, .etc.

The gender Directorate of health sector revealed there is gender mainstreaming or National manual. And there is awareness creation; there is no budget code for gender mainstreaming. If there is a budget and willing, the plan may be implemented and if not, it will be left out. There is no ear marked budget. Of course, there is an effort to mainstream gender though there is budget constraint. It is implemented through developing a proposal /fund acquired from donors.

There is no effort to address gender issues through employing gender mainstreaming as a strategy and allocation of gender responsive budgeting in the police commission. The gender desk of water & Sewerage Authority has its own annual plan and the management is positive and supportive to allocate budget if the request or proposal is made. There is an effort of the management to support the gender desk. As it is one person's desk, the performance of activities is done through mobilizing staffs of the sectors particularly during celebration of March 8, White ribbon's day etc. Of course, the function of gender desk is facilitated by the positive attitude of the management rather than being supported by regulation to address gender issues. The respondent of water & Sewerage strongly accused A.A. women's Affairs Bureau for the neglect of women's disk in different sectors. Besides, in all sectors there is no system or strategy to review projects or programs whether gender is mainstreamed or not. Gender responsive budget allocation & participation in the system is not existence in all sectors.

The Education sector Gender's directorate revealed as there are works with integration of different stakeholders in providing training for girls and leaders of clubs to empower women. However, the directorate does not directly engage with other women's organization. Relatively the health Bureau works with the women's association. Whereas, the gender desk of police commission and Water sewerage revealed as they do not have any work with women's Association.

Over half of the KII respondents confirmed that most organization programs did not included gender issues in their activities . Similarly the majority of the KII respondents have also confirmed that the majority of gender desk or focal persons do not participate during budgeting to ensure that it is gender responsive. There is a good effort in giving training for other sector members on gender issues. However some have complained as there is budget shortage to give adequate training on gender issues. Though there is an attempt to encourage personnel committee to have women representation the majority of the KII respondents have witnessed as there is no representation in the employment of women issues. There is an attempt to empower women in leadership position. Some sectors empower their skill before empowering women to the position.

There is a good attempt in planning and reporting and building the capacity at school and community level. This has to be encouraged to have more vertical and horizontal integration on to mainstream gender at all level since it is a cross cutting issues.

Table 6 Frequency of responses on Gender mainstreaming

Questions	Response	Frequency
How do you make sure that the organization programs included gender issues/	1. By conducting in-depth and wider discussion on the program we tried to check the inclusion of gender	6

	2. Yes , There is	9
	3. No	12
	4. the head is member of the management & follow the issue	2
Do you participate during budgeting to ensure that it is gender responsive?	1.. Yes	5
	2. No	14
	3. No budget code	4
have you given training on gender and the right of women in your sector	1.In the education sector in 2014 training has been given for 11 times	2
	2. We give training twice in a year	11
	3.No	4
	4. we started	5
	5. There is an interest but no budget	4
Do you participate in personnel employment	1. No	16
	According to the policy women get 3%	5
	There is an effort to have women in the committee but not yet materialized	5
What did you do to empower women to be able for leadership	1. It is giving training g on capacity building	9
	2. There is no gender desk , it is directorate(health)	4
	3. No gender desk	4
	4. Give training first and then empower to leadership	4
	5. Not adequate. only advocacy	3
	6. Giving additional point for women	3
Plan and report	1. We have plan and quarter report	9
	2. Yes we plan and report to plan and budgeting section	10
	3. No report	5
Strengthening the capacity of women and girls	1.training on capacity building	9
	2. Giving capacity for partner , youth and clubs	5
	3. Mainstream with routine work	8

n>20 due to multiple respondents

Summary of the KII respondents:

The survey results showed as the structure of women's desk varies from bureau to bureau. There is bureau without, with gender desk and at Gender directorate level. The structure of women's desk is not uniform and well equipped with adequate staff and budget. All bureaus are not in a position to mainstream gender for they do not have a well-defined structure & qualified personnel in gender related discipline. Besides, they do not have ear marked gender responsive budget though in some bureaus budget is secured for the desk/ directorate through pull fund. Relatively Health bureau Gender directorate works on health related issues to maternal health. The others are more dependent

on annual anniversary such as March 8, and White ribbon day. Moreover, in addressing GBV there seems a manual at health and Education bureau, there is a gap of owning seriously and familiarizing the manual for the leaders and staffs. If there is an occurrence of GBV, sectors pertinent to mitigate the issue such as police commission, justice, etc come together and get in to supporting and become cooperative.

- The structure of the women's desk varies from bureau to bureau. There is a directorate level on the one hand and a gender desk or focal person on the other hand. The structure of women's desk is not uniform and well equipped with adequate staff and budget. However, there is a trial by women's, Children's' & Social Affairs Bureau to strengthen the structure and act on gender mainstreaming activities.
- Fourteen respondents of the study responded that, currently there is no gender desk in their office. Simply there are focal person, who is not capable to conduct different activities due to lack of budget and lack of attention by organization staffs. Even though the focal persons plan to do different interventions, the office did not give priority gender issues
- Qualified staff in Gender discipline are not assigned to the desk, rather occupied by any unoccupied staff to fill the position as a leisure duty
- The majority of the KII respondents witnessed that the objective of the desk or focal persons do not align with the organization objectives. The respondents only mentioned the general principles
- Ten respondents know the national and international gender policy
- There is a need to conduct TOT for the gender desk and focal persons to make aware them on national and international women policy to play their role effectively
- Though in most gender and focal persons cases there is an effort to include the issue of gender in the life of women socially, economically and politically a lot remain to fully incorporate the organization objectives and performance
- The issue of Gender mainstreaming, Gender responsive budgeting, the linkage of the gender desks among other departments is not well realized
- Even if there exist gender focal person and the focal person plans different gender activities, practically, the planned activities will not be adequately implemented. In addition, there is no adequate follow up and evaluation by concerned bodies or departments.
- In general, the Gender Directorate or desks of the Sectors except Health bureau's gender more focused on engaging themselves works related to occasions and based on fund acquired from NGO's. There is a problem of systematically mainstreaming gender; it is more dependent on situations

MAJOR FINDINGS OF THE STUDY

1. Gender desks availability

- Except for Education, Health and Police commission who have got Gender desks a directorate level, all the other Bureaus Gender desks is removed from the organizational structure
- No GFP, no budget, no GM, GRB.....
- AA Transport Bureau has neither focal person nor gender desk
- At the moment AA Justice and Water – Sewerage Bureaus have focal person

2. Staffs (gender experts/focal persons)

- Gender desks lack qualified staffs who can professionally lead gender programs. In many offices, the desks are occupied by leisure staffs simply to fill the position
- Gender focal persons lack capacity and technical skills to implement Gender programs
- Gender desks are not linked with The AA city WCS affairs office to enable them access technical support and capacity building

3. GM and GRB (GM – Gender mainstreaming)

- Except for Health and Education Bureau where manuals are available for this purpose, GM and GRB are not even well known among other Bureaus. The depth of implementation by Health and education Bureau is an even
- Neither the program, finance nor the focal person have no knowledge on GM and GRB

4. Opportunities for employment, promotion.....

- Gender desks have no means to monitor employment of staffs by the organization, not informed
- Likewise, staff promotion is not monitored

5. Institutionalization of Gender program

- There is no guideline that can protect the rights of women at the workplace that can sustain a social norm that supports non – violence. (Ex for employment, promotion..)
- Actions depend on the willingness of the decision makers

6. Political Commitment

- The agenda requires political commitment of leaders
- Committed leaders make effort to sustaining the Gender desks, many lack such commitment
- Ex Public service and HR, Justice, small and micro enterprise Bureaus have revitalized the GFP and the budget - Commitment of the leaders

7. Duties and responsibilities

- No clear duties of the desks and Job descriptions are set for the GD and GFP

8. Response to VAW

- Anti GBV guideline developed by
- AA Women and children affairs in 2010 (AA city administration Coalition to prevent and mitigate GBV)
- FDRE MOH guideline issued in 2022 focusing on work place harassment, prevention and response. The guideline has incorporated the legal framework on the work place harassment, prevention measures and complaint handling mechanism
- FDRE MOE anti GBV manual for prevention of VAW in schools

This is promising start however

- The anti GBV guideline developed by the MOE in is not implemented or not known in many schools
- There is a start on Response for VAW survivors but need to be strengthened

RECOMMENDATIONS GIVEN

While gender is considered as a cross cutting issue, there is a need for persistent technical and other supports from different stakeholders. We recommend the following areas of training and capacity buildings:

1. General

- Gender is a cross cutting issue, hence structurally the gender desk has to be in place in all sector bureaus and qualified personnel have to be assigned. Restructuring need to take place to revitalize the gender desks along with qualified staff and budget to run the gender program
- There should be political commitment to address gender issues through employing gender mainstreaming strategy. Working on gender issues should not be on the willingness of the Bureau head or other leaders. This need to be mandatory task through a guideline or policy development
- Gender mainstreaming strategy manual should be developed at regional level for use by all the sectoral Bureaus
- Gender as cross cutting issue and its role in the development agenda is not well realized
- Interlink the gender desks with the AA city Women and children affairs Bureau to enable the desks access technical support and capacity building
- Gender mainstreaming strategy has to be taken for granted in all sectors, make mandatory; develop a system of implementation, monitoring and evaluation has to be in place.
- Institutionalizing gender issues in all the organizations departments through development of guidelines that ensure the protection and equal participation of women in all endeavours. Linkage of the gender desks with HR, Finance, Program....., need to be there as gender is crosscutting issue.

2. Specific to the Bureaus

Note:- Addis Ababa city Women, children and Social affairs Bureau: is the main actor and responsible body for enhancing gender program at regional level

SN	The Challenge	Recommendation	Responsible Body
1	Absence of Gender desks and Gender experts in most of the structure of the Bureaus more over	Revitalize the Gender desks along with gender experts position	Addis Ababa City public service and HR development Bureau
		Ensure all the bureaus have the gender desks with qualified	AA city Women children affairs and social affairs Bureau

	nobody is monitoring the gender desks function	gender focal person and budget	
	Lack of job description for the gender desks	Develop job description specific for the position	The Bureaus with the AA city Women children affairs and social affairs Bureau
2	Lack of budget specific to the Gender desks	Allocate budget for the Gender program activities	Addis Ababa City Finance and Economic development Bureau
3	Gender desks are not linked with the city women and children Affairs Bureau	Create structural linkage with the city women affairs Bureau	AA City public service and HR development Bureau and AA city Women children affairs Bureau
	Gender desks experts/focal persons lack capacity/skills to implement Gender programs	Provision of capacity building training	AA city Women children affairs and social affairs Bureau
	Gender mainstreaming and GRB are not well implemented	Development of Regional level Gender mainstreaming and GRB manual along with Capacity Building	The Bureaus with the AA city Women children affairs and social affairs Bureau
		Train program and finance staffs on GM and GRB to enhance their implementation	The Bureaus with the AA city Women children affairs and social affairs Bureau
	Gender desks are not interlinked with HR sectors in the Bureau or not involved during staff employment and promotion to avoid women's discrimination in this regard	Interlink Gender desks with HR sector and involve during staff promotion and employment	Sector Bureaus
	Absence of Gender guide line for implementation of gender program	Develop Gender guideline that that can <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • protect women from any work place discrimination • For employment and promoting of women to leadership positions 	The Bureaus with the AA city Women children affairs and social affairs Bureau
	Lack of political commitment by leaders	Empower leaders and Advocate on the need	AA city Women children affairs and social affairs Bureau and WROs

Moreover, attention is required on the following

Education Bureau: This is one of the sector Bureaus with gender desk at directorate level. The desk needs to strengthen its link with school clubs, children and women organizations in Addis Ababa. Along with strengthening gender mainstreaming and empowering women in the education sector, there is a need to create link with all departments of the Bureau

Health Bureau: This is the second sector with gender desk at directorate level. The desk needs to establish a link with all the Bureau departments like HR, Program, and finance to ensure that women's right at the work place is ensured.

Transport Bureau: This sector has neither focal person nor gender desk. Serious attention has to be given. As this is public service providing, it requires establishing the gender desk and assign competent

professionals with the necessary budget to mainstream gender issues. The office needs to assess the challenges and problems faced by women during provision of public transport

Public Service and HR Bureau: The head suggested strengthening the desk/directorate to revitalize and arrange the structure in the former position with adequate staff and budget to empower women and mainstream gender activities' effectively. At this sector there is only one focal person where the situation has to be improved structurally with competent professional experts and adequate budget

Housing development and management Bureau: There is no gender desk in this sector except a focal person. Both the head and the focal person suggested revitalizing the gender desk with adequate expert and budget to mainstream gender in the sector. The bureau is working on housing development that requires seeing the level of women served in the sector. Hence, due attention need to be given here

Justice Bureau(Attorney): According to the head of Justice Bureau, her organization is giving attention to women during employment and promotion. For example in AA Justice Bureau, the head and other 4 senior positions are held by women. She said that for the time being they have only one focal person. In the future they have a plan to strength it to desk or directorate level. Concerning budget allocation they have not had the system yet but some percent of the Bureau budget. The justice bureau beyond the political commitment they had, it always made effort to protect the rights of women at the work place and networked with Women Association. The study team also recommends capitalizing on this commitment as legal support is crosscutting issue in all the ten sectors found in AA.

Micro and Small Enterprises development: This sector had a desk over 6 staff members before this study. Currently the gender desk/directorate has reduced to team with only two focal persons due to low political commitment and less attention given to the area. The focal persons suggested improving the structural arrangement like the previous condition with professional expert and adequate budget since the sector is the main stakeholder to empowering women economically.

Conclusion

Women comprise more than half of the population globally including in Ethiopia and Addis Ababa. One cannot think development without addressing the issue of women adequately. Whereas Gender is a crosscutting issue, how much Gender mainstreaming GM is given attention in organizations a question as development agenda

Gender mainstreaming is simply looking at the human implications of any activity, highlighting the differences between women and men and thus the potential differential impacts and designing the activity to ensure that both men and women will benefit equally. These include

- Work-life balance and organizational culture.
- Gender balance in leadership and decision making.
- Gender equality in recruitment and career progression.
- Integration of the sex/gender dimension into research and teaching content.
- Measures against gender-based violence including sexual harassment.

- Gender mainstreaming makes public interventions more effective and ensures that inequalities are not perpetuated.

Mainstreaming includes gender-specific activities and affirmative action, whenever women or men are in a particularly disadvantageous position. GM is not about equality alone but also precondition for social justice, development and poverty reduction, However, the study reveals the issue of GM is lagging behind, not implemented effectively.

Ethiopia besides the national policies has ratified continental and international instrumentals pertaining to gender. However, the speed these are put in practice to ensure women's and men equal access to resources, opportunities, participation.... are not as expected, hence gender inequality still widely exists, unequal power and economic relation. The findings of this study are among the factors contributing to this failure. Hence, the government and all stakeholders must pay all the efforts to strengthen the Gender desks of the sectoral Bureaus of AA city administration.